

1. Content: What does the rubric assess?

Indicator	Level	Reasons/Comments/Recommended Changes
Target Alignment	3	The criteria align with each standard and what is important in each of those standards. It also puts it in student friendly language instead of ME1.1.1 making it easier to understand by EAL students.
Match to Essential Elements	3	The essential elements are at each level for students to see where their current understanding is. The trivial information is left out to help students focus on the essential elements.

2. Structure: Is the rubric organized logically?

Indicator	Level	Reasons/Comments/Recommended Changes
Number of Criteria	3	Within 1 <sup>st</sup> grade and this being a student owned, each standard was its own criteria. This was used to maximum clarity for students. These are also relatively easy standards with it being the first unit of the year.
Independence of Criteria	3	Each criterion has been fixed to represent the essential element from that standard. Before, I had steady beat twice and that was not clear of where it would be assessed. Specifically, when steady beat was not the essential element within that standard. It was for them to perform their composition fast and slow, (Presto and Largo).
Grouping of Descriptors	3	For this unit, there were no grouping of descriptors as these are very specific skill sets. Understanding, throughout the year when we get to timbre and form, the criteria and descriptors will have multiple standards within it.
Number of Levels	3	I used 3 levels for student clarity. It is much easier for a student to assess themselves across 3 levels than 5. I have tried both and have seen 3 work much better as a self-reflection. These are also not complex standards that would require more levels with this being for 1 <sup>st</sup> graders.

3. Descriptors: Are the details fleshed out well?

Indicator	Level	Reasons/Comments/Recommended Changes
Kind of Detail	3	The new rubric has enough detail for my 1 <sup>st</sup> graders to see what is expected for maximum points. My hope is that my students will use this to their advantage when creating their melody to do as well as possible.
Content of Levels	3/2	The new rubric levels are more organized across and easy to follow what is expected at each level. The build upon each other with specific examples of mistakes allowed at each level.
Formative Usefulness	3	While this is a summative, I do plan on having this available for my students to assess their own work before they submit. This is to maximize ownership of learning and process. I want to highlight the process over the product.

**Original Learning Target Rubric**

**High Achievement Unit Outcome:**

Students will create music by combining and organizing musical rhythms and evaluate different rhythms for their rhythmic value.

Learning Targets	3 Points	2 Points	1 Point
ME1.1.1	Demonstrates steady beat with few if any errors while performing.	Performs with steady beat with a couple of errors but is able to finish the song.	Struggles to finish the song with steady beat. Major errors
ME1.1.2	Performs their melody by reading left to right with fluency.	Performs their melody but with few mistakes while stopping.	Performs their melody but skips section of their song. Does not finish.
ME1.1.3	Both versions are significantly different speeds, while maintaining a steady beat with both.	Both versions are similar speeds with a consistent steady beat.	Both versions are the same speed. Both songs are struggled to keep a steady beat.
ME1.1.4	Melody has various rhythms including short and long notes.	Melody has primarily the same long or short rhythm repeated throughout.	Melody is the same long or short rhythm repeated.

**Original Learning Target Rubric**

**High Achievement Unit Outcome:**

Students will create music by combining and organizing musical rhythms and evaluate different rhythms for their rhythmic value.

Criteria	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1
<b>Beat Steadiness</b>	Demonstrates steady beat with <b>no</b> errors while performing. <b>3 Points</b>	Performs with steady beat with a <b>4 or less</b> errors but is able to finish the song. <b>2 Points</b>	Struggles to finish the song. <b>No steady beat.</b> Major errors, <b>5 or more.</b> <b>1 Point</b>
<b>Reading Fluency</b>	Performs their melody by reading left to right <b>fluently without stopping.</b> <b>3 Points</b>	Performs their melody but with few <b>(3 or less)</b> mistakes while stopping. <b>2 Points</b>	Performs their melody but skips sections of their song. Does not finish. <b>4 or more mistakes.</b> <b>1 Point</b>
<b>Technique (Speed)</b>	Both versions are significantly different speeds, while <b>maintaining rhythmic accuracy.</b> <b>3 Points</b>	Both versions are similar speeds with <b>various rhythmic component.</b> <b>2 Points</b>	<b>Both versions are the same speed with various rhythms played.</b> <b>1 Point</b>
<b>Rhythm Composition</b>	Melody has various rhythms including short and long notes. <b>(Ta, Ta-a, Titi, TikaTika, and Rest)</b> <b>3 Points</b>	Melody has primarily the same long or short rhythm repeated throughout. <b>2 Points</b>	Melody is the same long or short rhythm repeated. <b>1 Point</b>

**Summary:**

I found this activity to be insightful and thought provoking. I have never gone through this type of guideline to create a rubric. It was interesting because I wonder how this rubric would be reviewed by students. I have had my students and I co-construct rubrics for Summatives to again, promote ownership of their learning process and also to get buy in for such tasks. I am interested to see if this would be taken positively or negatively by students. This really has helped me in my understanding of what I am looking for with this specific rubric. It is ironed out some things that came up such as “What does various mean?” How many is various? So having the exact rhythmic notation expected is going to help my students know what to aim for. I do appreciate that aspect of this new rubric. I also liked putting exact numbers of 3 or less and 4 or more and no mistakes to show what we are looking for. I believe this is going to be incredibly helpful when justifying why John got 2 points and I can point at the 3 mistakes within his melody.

One thing I would do with this rubric is when the student submit, I would like them to assess themselves and highlight where they think they are and then I would like to go over that information to see how critically they compared the rubric to their own composition. This was a tough assignment because it was out of understanding but I am glad to have done it and see how this rubric would help not only assess students but to also show next steps as well.